

## § 1201.57

(1) *Substantial evidence.* The degree of relevant evidence that a reasonable person, considering the record as a whole, might accept as adequate to support a conclusion, even though other reasonable persons might disagree. This is a lower standard of proof than preponderance of the evidence.

(2) *Preponderance of the evidence.* The degree of relevant evidence that a reasonable person, considering the record as a whole, would accept as sufficient to find that a contested fact is more likely to be true than untrue.

(3) *Harmful error.* Error by the agency in the application of its procedures that is likely to have caused the agency to reach a conclusion different from the one it would have reached in the absence or cure of the error. The burden is upon the appellant to show that the error was harmful, i.e., that it caused substantial harm or prejudice to his or her rights.

[54 FR 53504, Dec. 29, 1989, as amended at 56 FR 41748, Aug. 23, 1991]

## § 1201.57 Order of hearing.

(a) In cases in which the agency has taken an action against an employee, the agency will present its case first.

(b) The appellant will proceed first at hearings convened on the issues of:

- (1) Jurisdiction;
- (2) Timeliness; or

(3) Office of Personnel Management disallowance of retirement benefits, when the appellant applied for those benefits.

(c) The judge may vary the normal order of presenting evidence.

## § 1201.58 Closing the record.

(a) When there is a hearing, the record ordinarily will close at the conclusion of the hearing. When the judge allows the parties to submit argument, briefs, or documents previously identified for introduction into evidence, however, the record will remain open for as much time as the judge grants for that purpose.

(b) If the appellant waives the right to a hearing, the record will close on the date the judge sets as the final date for the receipt or filing of submissions of the parties.

(c) Once the record closes, no additional evidence or argument will be ac-

## 5 CFR Ch. II (1–1–04 Edition)

cepted unless the party submitting it shows that the evidence was not readily available before the record closed. The judge will include in the record, however, any supplemental citations received from the parties or approved corrections of the transcript, if one has been prepared.

### EVIDENCE

## § 1201.61 Exclusion of evidence and testimony.

Any evidence and testimony that is offered in the hearing and excluded by the judge will be described, and that description will be made a part of the record.

## § 1201.62 Producing prior statements.

After an individual has given evidence in a proceeding, any party may request a copy of any prior signed statement made by that individual that is relevant to the evidence given. If the party refuses to furnish the statement, the judge may exclude the evidence given.

## § 1201.63 Stipulations.

The parties may stipulate to any matter of fact. The stipulation will satisfy a party's burden of proving the fact alleged.

## § 1201.64 Official notice.

Official notice is the Board's or judge's recognition of certain facts without requiring evidence to be introduced establishing those facts. The judge, on his or her own motion or on the motion of a party, may take official notice of matters of common knowledge or matters that can be verified. The parties may be given an opportunity to object to the taking of official notice. The taking of official notice of any fact satisfies a party's burden of proving that fact.

### DISCOVERY

## § 1201.71 Purpose of discovery.

Proceedings before the Board will be conducted as expeditiously as possible with due regard to the rights of the parties. Discovery is designed to enable a party to obtain relevant information needed to prepare the party's case.

## Merit Systems Protection Board

## § 1201.73

These regulations are intended to provide a simple method of discovery. They will be interpreted and applied so as to avoid delay and to facilitate adjudication of the case. Parties are expected to start and complete discovery with a minimum of Board intervention.

### § 1201.72 Explanation and scope of discovery.

(a) *Explanation.* Discovery is the process, apart from the hearing, by which a party may obtain relevant information, including the identification of potential witnesses, from another person or a party, that the other person or party has not otherwise provided. Relevant information includes information that appears reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. This information is obtained to assist the parties in preparing and presenting their cases. The Federal Rules of Civil Procedure may be used as a general guide for discovery practices in proceedings before the Board. Those rules, however, are instructive rather than controlling.

(b) *Scope.* Discovery covers any non-privileged matter that is relevant to the issues involved in the appeal, including the existence, description, nature, custody, condition, and location of documents or other tangible things, and the identity and location of persons with knowledge of relevant facts. Discovery requests that are directed to nonparties and nonparty Federal agencies and employees are limited to information that appears directly material to the issues involved in the appeal.

(c) *Methods.* Parties may use one or more of the methods provided under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. These methods include written interrogatories, depositions, requests for production of documents or things for inspection or copying, and requests for admission.

(d) *Limitations.* The judge may limit the frequency or extent of use of the discovery methods permitted by these regulations. Such limitations may be imposed if the judge finds that the discovery sought is:

(1) Cumulative or duplicative, or is obtainable from some other source that

is more convenient, less burdensome, or less expensive;

(2) The party seeking discovery has had sufficient opportunity by discovery in the action to obtain the information sought; or

(3) The burden or expense of the proposed discovery outweighs its likely benefit.

[68 FR 54651, Sept. 18, 2003]

### § 1201.73 Discovery procedures.

(a) *Discovery from a party.* A party seeking discovery from another party must start the process by serving a request for discovery on the representative of the other party or the party if there is no representative. The request for discovery must state the time limit for responding, as prescribed in § 1201.73(d), and must specify the time and place of the taking of the deposition, if applicable. When a party directs a request for discovery to an officer or employee of a Federal agency that is a party, the agency must make the officer or employee available on official time to respond to the request, and must assist the officer or employee as necessary in providing relevant information that is available to the agency.

(b) *Discovery from a nonparty, including a nonparty Federal agency.* Parties should try to obtain voluntary discovery from nonparties whenever possible. A party seeking discovery from a nonparty Federal agency or employee must start the process by serving a request for discovery on the nonparty Federal agency or employee. A party may begin discovery from other nonparties by serving a request for discovery on the nonparty directly. If the party seeking the information does not make that request, or if it does so but fails to obtain voluntary cooperation, it may obtain discovery from a nonparty by filing a written motion with the judge, showing the relevance, scope, and materiality of the particular information sought. If the party seeks to take a deposition, it should state in the motion the date, time, and place of the proposed deposition. An authorized official of the Board will issue a ruling on the motion, and will serve the ruling on the moving party. That official